Corrosion Resistant TiTaN and TiTaAlN Thin Films Grown by Hybrid HiPIMS/DCMS Using Synchronized Pulsed Substrate Bias with No External Substrate Heating

Yuri Chipatecua Godoy 1, Olof Tengstrand 2, Jairo Olaya Florez 3, Ivan Petrov 2,4, Erika Bustos 5, Lars Hultman 2, Alberto Herrera-Gomez 1, J.E. Greene 2,4,6,7 and Grzegorz Greczynski 2,*

1 Lib. Norponiente 2000, Fracc. Real de Juriquilla, CINVESTAV-Unidad Queretaro, Queretaro 76230, Mexico; yurilcg@gmail.com (Y.C.G.); aherrerag@cinvestav.mx (A.H.-G.)
2 Department of Physics (IFM), Linköping University, SE 581 83 Linköping, Sweden; olof.tengstrand@gmail.com (O.T.); petrov@illinois.edu (I.P .); lars.hultman@liu.se (L.H.);
3 Department of Mechanical and Mechatronic Engineering, Faculty of Engineering, Universidad Nacional de Colombia, Bogota 14490, Colombia; jjolaya@unal.edu.co
4 Department of Material Science, Physics, and the Frederick Seitz Materials Research Laboratory, University of Illinois, Urbana, IL 61801, USA
5 Department of Science, CIDETEQ, Queretaro, Qro 76703, Mexico; ebustos@cideteq.mx
6 Department of Physics, University of Illinois, Urbana, IL 61801, USA
7 Materials Science Department, National Taiwan University of Science and Technology, Taipei 10607, Taiwan

* Correspondence: grzegorz.greczynski@liu.se

Received: 12 November 2019; Accepted: 2 December 2019; Published: 9 December 2019

Abstract: Ti_{0.92}Ta_{0.08}N and Ti_{0.41}Al_{0.51}Ta_{0.08}N thin films grown on stainless-steel substrates, with no external heating, by hybrid high-power impulse and dc magnetron sputtering (HiPIMS/DCMS), were investigated for corrosion resistance. The Ta target was operated in HiPIMS mode to supply pulsed Ta-ion fluxes, while two Ti (or Ti and Al) targets were operated in DCSM mode in order to provide a high deposition rate. Corrosion resistance was investigated using potentiodynamic polarization and electrochemical impedance spectroscopy employing a 3.5% NaCl solution at room temperature. The 300-nm-thick transition-metal nitride coatings exhibited good corrosion resistance due to film densification resulting from pulsed heavy Ta-ion irradiation during film growth. Corrosion protective efficiencies were above 99.8% for both Ti_{0.41}Al_{0.51}Ta_{0.08}N and Ti_{0.92}Ta_{0.08}N, and pore resistance was apparently four orders of magnitude higher than for bare 304 stainless-steel substrates.

Keywords: HiPIMS; hard coatings; corrosion; TiTaN coatings; TiTaAlN coatings

1. Introduction

Refractory transition-metal (TM) nitride thin films are used in a wide variety of applications due to their unique combination of properties, which include high hardness [1–5]; scratch and abrasion resistance [6]; low coefficient of friction [7]; high-temperature oxidation resistance [8–10]; and tunable optical [11,12], electrical [11,13,14], and thermal [14], properties. As a result, TM nitrides are widely used as wear-resistant coatings [15,16], decorative coatings [17], and diffusion barriers [18–24]; the latter because of their high thermal stability [10,25] and low electrical resistivity [13].

For many of the above applications, especially diffusion barriers, dense, high-crystalline-quality films grown by physical vapor deposition (PVD) at much lower temperatures are required in order to minimize deposition cycling times and allow the use of thermally-sensitive substrates such as
polymers and light-weight metals (e.g., Li, Mg, and Al). The primary technique employed to obtain dense, hard, low-stress refractory thin films by PVD at reduced growth temperatures has been the use of inert-gas ion irradiation [26–29] to provide dynamic ion mixing and ion-bombardment-enhanced surface adatom mobilities [26,29–31]. However, progress achieved in low-temperature densification by this route often comes at the expense of producing large compressive stresses due to trapping of inert gas ions, and recoil implantation of film atoms, into interstitial sites [26,29–39].

Greczynski et al. recently reported a novel PVD approach for the growth of dense, hard, and low-stress refractory TM nitride thin films without external substrate heating. [40] TiN was used as an initial model materials system, while employing hybrid high-power impulse and dc magnetron co-sputtering (HiPIMS/DCMS) [40–42], with synchronized substrate bias [40–43], to deposit Ti$_{1-x}$Ta$_x$N [40] and Ti$_{1-x-y}$Al$_y$Ta$_x$N alloys [44]. Dense Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N alloy films, with thicknesses between 2.0 and 2.6 µm, were grown with no external substrate heating. The Ta concentration of 8 at % on the cation sublattice was chosen based upon the desire to minimize plasma heating of the substrate during HiPIMS pulses at the Ta target, while still delivering a sufficient flux of energetic heavy Ta$^+/Ta^{2+}$ ions to provide film densification via overlapping collision cascades as discussed in detail in ref. [40]. Maximum film deposition temperatures $T_s$ due to plasma heating were <120 °C.

Here, we investigate the corrosion resistance, in saline environments, of Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N alloy films deposited by hybrid HiPIMS/DCMS co-sputtering, with synchronized substrate bias [40,44], on polished 304 stainless-steel substrates. Corrosion tests were performed in a conventional electrochemical cell, employing a saturated calomel electrode (SCE) as a reference, with a 3.5% NaCl solution at room temperature. Potential scans were conducted from $-0.3$ to $+0.4$ V after each sample was immersed in the solution for 45 min; corrosion potentials, corrosion current densities, anodic slopes, and cathodic slopes were determined. Electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) measurements were performed at open-circuit potential using the same cell configuration and sample area as in the polarization experiments. The overall results for the 300-nm-thick hybrid DCMS/HiPIMS TiTaN and TiAlN layers show that both sets of films exhibit enhanced corrosion resistance in 3.5% NaCl solutions, with more noble corrosion potentials and lower corrosion currents, than much thicker (1.6 µm) TiN coatings deposited by HiPIMS [45], 1.25-µm-thick TiN coatings deposited by HiPIMS and DCMS [46], 5.3-µm-thick Ti/TiN multilayers deposited by electron-beam evaporation [47], and 2-µm-thick TiN/TiAlN multilayers deposited by DCMS [48].

2. Experimental Procedures

2.1. Film Growth

Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N alloy films were grown, based upon calibration curves for film compositions vs. target powers and substrate bias [40,44], in a CC800/9 CemeCon AG magnetron sputtering system equipped with cast rectangular 8.8 × 50 cm$^2$ Ti, Al, and Ta targets. Stainless-steel 304 and Si(001) substrates, 2.54 × 1.00 and 2.00 × 1.00 cm$^2$, respectively, were mounted directly below, and parallel to, the Ta target. Either two Ti targets, or a Ti and an Al target, were mounted symmetrically on each side of the Ta target and tilted toward the substrate with a 21° angle between the substrate normal and the normal to each outlying target. The target-to-substrate distance was 18 cm, and the system base pressure was 3.8 × 10$^{-7}$ Torr (0.05 mPa). The substrates were cleaned sequentially in acetone and isopropyl alcohol before being mounted on a platen with clips.

No external substrate heating was applied during deposition and substrate temperature $T_s$, monitored with calibrated [40] thermocouples bonded to dummy substrates, reached a maximum of <120 °C, due to plasma heating, during deposition of 300-nm-thick films.

In the hybrid approach used magnetron with Ta target was driven in HiPIMS mode to provide Ta-ion irradiation, while the Ti and Al targets were operated in DCMS mode [40]. The average HiPIMS-Ta target power was 1.0 kW with a pulse energy of 5 J at a pulsing frequency of 100 Hz
Ta at all other times, the substrates are at negative floating potential, V_f = V_t = 12 V. The maximum densities of incident Ta⁺ and Ta²⁺ ions were 3.1 × 10^6 and 4.3 × 10^6 cps, and the fraction Ta²⁺/(Ta⁺ + Ta²⁺) of doubly-ionized Ta²⁺ metal-ion flux during HiPIMS pulses was 0.54. A more detailed description of the resulting Ta⁺/Ta²⁺ irradiation conditions was presented in reference [40].

2.2. Film Characterization

2.2.1. Film Compositions

The metal fractions x and y in Tiₓ₋ₓTaₓN and Tiₓ₋ₓ₋₉AlₓTaₓN film were obtained from energy-dispersive x-ray spectroscopy (EDS) measurements, carried out on fracture cross-sections of films grown on Si(001) wafers, in a LEO 1550 scanning electron microscope (SEM) (Carl Zeiss, Oberkochen, Germany) equipped with an AZtec X-max EDS system operated at 20 keV. N/metal fractions and background impurity concentrations were obtained by time-of-flight elastic recoil detection analyses (TOF-ERDA) employing a 36 MeV \(^{127}\)I⁺ beam incident at 67.5° relative to the sample normal, with the detector at a 45° recoil scattering angle [49]. ERDA data were analyzed using the CONTES code [50]. The obtained N/metal ratios = 1.00 ± 0.05, reveal that all layers are stoichiometric. The uncertainties in the reported metal concentrations, Ti₀.97Ta₀.08N and Ti₀.41Al₀.51Ta₀.08N, on the cation sublattice were less than ±1%. oxygen and argon concentrations were lower than 0.4 and 0.5 at %, respectively, while carbon was below the detection limit.

2.2.2. Film Microstructure

For the corrosion experiments, 300-nm-thick Ti₀.97Ta₀.08N and Ti₀.41Al₀.51Ta₀.08N layers were deposited on polished 304 stainless-steel substrates. θ–2θ X-ray diffraction (XRD) and X-ray reflectivity (XRR) scans were acquired with a Philips X-Pert MRD system to determine film orientation and density. XRR results, analyzed using the fitting procedure described in ref. [51], are reported for Ti₀.97Ta₀.08N and Ti₀.41Al₀.51Ta₀.08N layers in references [40] and [44], respectively. Film microstructure was analyzed using plan-view and cross-sectional scanning electron microscopy (XSEM), before and after corrosion testing, in a 7601F instrument (JEOL, Tokyo, Japan).

2.2.3. Electrochemical Measurements

Ti₀.97Ta₀.08N and Ti₀.41Al₀.51Ta₀.08N layers, 300-nm-thick as determined by profilometry measurements, on polished 304 stainless-steel substrates were subjected to corrosion tests carried out in a conventional electrochemical cell employing a saturated calomel electrode (SCE) in room-temperature 3.5% NaCl solutions with a Gamry 600 potentiostat (Gamry Instruments, Warminster, PA, USA). The exposed sample area was always 0.17 cm². In these investigations, the potential is scanned from −0.3 to +0.4 V vs. SCE, with a 0.4 mV s⁻¹ potential sweep, following 45-min sample immersions in 3.5% saline solutions. The results were analyzed to determine the corrosion potential Ecorr, corrosion current density jcorr, anodic slope ba, and cathodic slope bc by means of the Tafel extrapolation method [52] using the Echem Analyst software (Version 5.30) [53] from Gamry Instruments.

Electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS) measurements as a function of frequency were performed at open-circuit potential (OCP) with the same cell configuration, area, and potentiostat used in the polarization experiments. A 10-mV sinusoidal potential was applied at frequencies from 10⁻² to 10⁵ Hz and the results were acquired as a function of saline solution exposure times: 1, 24, 48,
72, and 168 h. Impedance plots were interpreted based upon an equivalent circuit analyzed using the Echem Analyst software version 5.30 [53].

X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (XPS) composition depth profiles of Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers on stainless-steel substrates, before and after corrosion testing, were obtained in an Axis Ultra DLD instrument (Manchester, UK) using monochromatic Al Kα radiation (hv = 1486.6 eV). The profiles were acquired as the samples were sputter-etched with a 4 keV, 12.7 mA cm$^{-2}$, Ar$^+$ beam incident at 70° with respect to the sample normal. Oxygen concentrations in bulk layers were below detection limits, ~1 at %, consistent with the films being essentially fully dense. In addition, there was no evidence for the presence of stainless-steel substrate species (primarily Fe, Cr, and Ni) in the films following the corrosion tests, again indicating that the layers were fully dense.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Film Microstructure

Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N XRD scans are shown in Figure 1. The only observable features over the 2θ range from 10° to 43° are cubic B1-NaCl-structure (111) and (002) film peaks, small (022) film peaks, and the (111) and (002) peaks from the stainless-steel substrate. XRD peak positions and peak shapes for the TM nitride alloys are in agreement with previous XRD and selected-area electron diffraction (SAED) patterns obtained from Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers described in [40,44].

![Figure 1. XRD scans from 300-nm-thick Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers deposited on 304 stainless-steel substrates.](image)

The Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N 111 and 002 diffraction peaks in Figure 1 are shifted to lower 2θ values, with respect to TiN reference peaks, as a result of TaN alloying. TaN has a larger lattice constant, 4.35 Å, than that of TiN, 4.24 Å [40]. The relaxed lattice constant a$_r$ of Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N is 4.28 ± 0.01 Å as determined from XRD scans acquired at the strain-free tilt angle $ψ$, defined as $ψ^* = \arcsin{2\nu/(1 + \nu)}$, [40] in which $\nu$ is the Poisson ratio, 0.23 [40]. The residual compressive stress $σ$, obtained from $\sin^2\psi$ analyses, is <1 GPa.

Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N peak positions in Figure 1 are shifted to even larger 2θ values and the alloy has a relaxed lattice constant of 4.24 ± 0.01 Å. While XRD does not reveal any second-phase wurtzite-AlN peaks, SAED and lattice-resolution imaging [40] show the presence of small, nanometer-size (5 ± 3 nm) wurtzite-AlN grains at the boundaries between B1-NaCl-structure columns. The compressive stress in Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers is 1.6 ± 0.2 GPa.

The combination of medium and high-resolution cross-sectional transmission electron microscopy (XTEM, FEI Tecnai G2 TF 20 UT) with corresponding selected-area electron diffraction (SAED) patterns, and XSEM analyses of thick Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N samples grown on Si(001) substrates,
shows that all films are columnar with a 111 preferred orientation and no observable porosity. The XTEM and SAED results are identical to those reported in [40,44] and are thus not repeated here. X-ray reflectivity data confirm that the films are essentially fully dense. For comparison, TiN films grown by DCMS under conditions (including the lack of external substrate heating) identical to those of the HiPIMS/DCMS alloy films, but without pulsed sputtering from the HiPIMS target, were extremely underdense (65% density) with inter- and intracolumnar voids [40]. XSEM results from films grown on 304 stainless-steel substrates show the same dense columnar structures as those grown on Si and XRD results confirm that the layers also exhibit 111 preferred orientation.

Figure 2 consists of typical Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N XSEM images from 300-nm-thick layers grown on 304 stainless-steel substrates. Both films exhibit a dense, columnar, zone-T structure [36] with rounded column tops and smooth surfaces. Root-mean-square roughnesses, measured using a DEKTAK 150 profilometer, are 8.4 nm for Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and 5.4 nm Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N. The smoother Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N surfaces correlates well with their smaller average grain sizes due to column renucleation and grain refinement resulting from a small degree of phase separation as indicated by XTEM. Average column diameters $\langle d \rangle$ are 68 ± 26 nm for Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and 48 ± 14 nm for Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N.

![XSEM images of 300-nm-thick (a) Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and (b) Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers deposited on 304 stainless-steel substrates.](image)

3.2. Electrochemical Behavior

3.2.1. Potentiostatic Corrosion Measurements

The open-circuit potential (OCP) as a function of exposure time in room-temperature 3.5% brine solutions is shown in Figure 3 for Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N thin films, as well as for an uncoated 304 stainless-steel substrate. Saturated calomel is used as the reference electrode. Local corrosion of the TM nitride and stainless-steel samples is promoted by Cl$^-$ ions in the conducting electrolytic solution. The initial OCP measurements for each sample were made after 1 h of immersion in order to avoid transient effects [54]. Subsequent measurements were after 24, 48, 72, and 168 h of continuous immersion without external disturbance.

OCP values for uncoated substrate are negative for the entire 168 h of immersion, indicating, in agreement with potentiodynamic corrosion measurements presented in Section 3.2.2, a relatively low resistance to corrosion. It has been shown previously that 304 ss in 3.5% brine solutions forms a passive protective surface composed of a Cr-enriched inner oxide layer, with a hydroxide outer layer [55–57]. However, the oxide layer has a lower Cr concentration than in the fully passive state. Moreover, the CrO$_x$ layer is typically only a few nm thick and defective, such that the brine solution can induce pitting corrosion, resulting in a decrease in OCP. Over time, the CrO$_x$ layer forms and ruptures.

For 168 h of immersion, both Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N exhibit a much more noble corrosion potential, with positive OCP values, than stainless steel, indicating a larger thermodynamic resistance to the onset of corrosion [58]. Thus, the TM nitride layers significantly enhance the corrosion resistance of their substrates.
The OCP results for Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N also exhibit oscillations, but on a longer time scale. There is an initial decrease in OCP during the first 48 h of immersion, which is due to electrolyte penetration through column boundaries. An aluminum-oxide layer that forms slowly leads to an increase in OCP, but since the oxide is defective, the OCP drops again, this time more slowly. Initial, Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N OCP values are lower than those for Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N indicating an enhanced ion permeation rate into the layer, which is attributed to the smaller grain size (larger number density of column boundaries). The OCP is essentially the same for both TM nitride layers after 168 h of immersion in the brine solution.

The oscillations are very repeatable for both Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers; an example of the agreement is shown in Figure 3 for Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers.

### 3.2.2. Potentiodynamic Corrosion Measurements

Figure 4 consists of potentiodynamic corrosion plots, recorded at RT after 45 min of sample immersion in 3.5% NaCl solution, for substrates coated with 300-nm-thick Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers as well as for bare 304 stainless-steel substrates. The plots are based upon the Tafel equation [52]:

\[
\eta = a + b \log(j_{\text{corr}})
\]

in which \(\eta\) is the electrochemical overpotential, \(\eta = (\eta_{\text{applied}} - \eta_{\text{equilibrium}})\), and \(j_{\text{corr}}\) is the net corrosion current density due to the application of the overpotential: that is, \(j_{\text{corr}}\) is the difference between the current density of the oxidation and reduction reactions, \(j_{\text{corr}} = j_{\text{ox}} - |j_{\text{red}}|\). The term \(a\) in equation (1) is the exchange current density when \(\eta = 0\), and \(b\) is the “Tafel slope” required to increase the equilibrium current density (\(\eta = 0\)) by an order of magnitude. The empirical parameters are obtained via the following equations:

\[
a = 2.303(RT/\alpha nF) \log(j_{\text{corr}})
\]

\[
b = 2.303(RT/\alpha nF)
\]
for which $n$, $R$, and $F$ are the number of electrons involved in the reaction, the ideal gas constant, and the Faraday constant, respectively. $T$ is the system temperature; and $\alpha$ is the charge transfer coefficient, [53] defined as $\alpha_c = -(RT/F)(d \ln I_c/\alpha) = -(RT/F)(d \ln I_a/\alpha)$ for the cathodic and anodic reactions, respectively.

![Figure 4. Potentiodynamic polarization curves; potential $\eta$ [V vs. SCE] vs. current density $j$ [A cm$^{-2}$], for uncoated 304 stainless-steel and 304 stainless-steel substrates coated with 300-nm-thick Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N thin films after immersion in 3.5% brine solutions for 45 min at room temperature.](image)

The applied overpotential $\eta$ is plotted vs. the corrosion current density $j_{corr}$ in the potentiodynamic curves in Figure 4. $\eta$ is determined with respect to SCE, and the corrosion velocity is proportional to $\log(j_{corr})$ [60]. The sequence of all parallel electrochemical reactions involved in the corrosion process is reflected in the plots. The upper branches show the anodic (oxidation) reactions resulting in film dissolution, followed by formation and breakdown of passive layers on 304 ss substrates. Correspondingly, the lower branches reveal the cathodic reactions which involve the reduction of hydrogen and oxygen. All these processes take place simultaneously, with the slower one determining the system corrosion velocity $j_{corr}$. Hence, the upper and lower branches intersection points in Figure 4 define the corrosion current density $j_{corr}$ and the corrosion potential $E_{corr}$. The latter parameter corresponds to the activation energy per atom necessary to dissolve the crystal lattice into the electrolyte. Corrosion proceeds more rapidly if $E_{corr}$ is negative with a small absolute value.

As shown in Figure 4, $E_{corr}$ for the 304 stainless-steel substrate is $-0.450$ V and $j_{corr}$ is $3.60 \times 10^{-5}$ A cm$^{-2}$, while for substrates coated with Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers, $E_{corr}$ is $-0.170$ and $-0.204$ V and $j_{corr}$ is $1.88 \times 10^{-8}$ and $5.40 \times 10^{-8}$ A cm$^{-2}$, respectively. The lower value of $E_{corr}$ and higher value of $j_{corr}$ for bare stainless steel is due to the more rapid dissolution of stainless steel, which is accelerated in the presence of Cl$^-$ ions that promote selective dissolution of iron [55,61]. In addition, the Cl$^-$ ions can also breakdown the thin passive layer to cause pitting corrosion, giving rise to a decrease in OCP as shown in Figure 3 and discussed in Section 3.2.1.

$R_p$, the resistance of the system to leave its equilibrium state when an overpotential $\eta$ is applied, was also evaluated. $R_p$ is related to the corrosion rate $j_{corr}$ through the anodic $b_a$ and cathodic $b_c$ Tafel slopes, determined using Equation (3), by the Stern-Geary equation [62,63]:

$$R_p = \frac{b_a \times b_c}{2.303 \times j_{corr}(b_a + b_c)} \quad (4)$$

As shown in Equation (4), there is an inverse relationship between $R_p$ and $j_{corr}$; thus, at lower $R_p$, the corrosion current density is higher. To quantify the protection due to coating the 304 ss substrates,
we calculate the protective efficiencies \( P_e \) correlating the corrosion current density of the film \( j_{corr} \) to that of the 304 ss substrate \( j_{corr}^{sub} \) via Equation (5) [47,48,64,65]:

\[
(\%) P_e = \left[ 1 - \left( \frac{j_{corr}}{j_{corr}^{sub}} \right) \right] \times 100
\]  

As summarized in Table 1, \( R_p \) for substrates coated with \( \text{Ti}_{0.41}\text{Al}_{0.51}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) and \( \text{Ti}_{0.92}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) layers, increases roughly by four orders of magnitude, with respect to bare 304 ss. Table 1 also shows that the protective efficiency \( P_e \) is above 99.8% for both films: 99.84% for \( \text{Ti}_{0.41}\text{Al}_{0.51}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) and 99.95% for \( \text{Ti}_{0.92}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \). We attribute the excellent corrosion resistance of \( \text{Ti}_{0.92}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) and \( \text{Ti}_{0.41}\text{Al}_{0.51}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) layers, in protecting stainless-steel substrates, to microstructure densification caused by irradiation with heavy-metal \( \text{Ta}^+/\text{Ta}^{2+} \) ions. This induces atomic mixing and decreases both inter- and intracolumn porosity [44] as shown in Figure 2.

**Table 1.** Corrosion parameters obtained from potentiodynamic polarization measurements (Figure 4) carried out on uncoated 304 stainless-steel and 304 stainless-steel substrates coated with 300-nm-thick \( \text{Ti}_{0.92}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) and \( \text{Ti}_{0.41}\text{Al}_{0.51}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) thin films immersed in 3.5% brine solutions. \( j_{corr} \) is the corrosion current density, \( E_{corr} \) is the corrosion potential, \( b_a \) is the anodic Tafel slope, \( b_c \) is the cathodic Tafel slope, \( R_p \) is the polarization resistance, and \( P_e \) is the protective efficiency.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samples</th>
<th>( j_{corr} ) [A·cm(^{-2})]</th>
<th>( E_{corr} ) [V]</th>
<th>( b_a ) [mV·dec(^{-1})]</th>
<th>( b_c ) [mV·dec(^{-1})]</th>
<th>( R_p ) [kΩ·cm(^{-2})]</th>
<th>( P_e ) [%]</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>( \text{Ti}<em>{0.92}\text{Ta}</em>{0.08}\text{N} )</td>
<td>( 1.88 \times 10^{-8} )</td>
<td>( -1.70 \times 10^{-1} )</td>
<td>0.647</td>
<td>0.262</td>
<td>2.28 \times 10^4</td>
<td>99.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( \text{Ti}<em>{0.41}\text{Al}</em>{0.51}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} )</td>
<td>( 5.40 \times 10^{-8} )</td>
<td>( -2.04 \times 10^{-1} )</td>
<td>1.002</td>
<td>0.242</td>
<td>8.30 \times 10^3</td>
<td>99.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>304 stainless steel</td>
<td>( 3.60 \times 10^{-5} )</td>
<td>( -4.50 \times 10^{-1} )</td>
<td>0.061</td>
<td>0.112</td>
<td>2.47</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Plan-view SEM images of the surface morphology of \( \text{Ti}_{0.92}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) and \( \text{Ti}_{0.41}\text{Al}_{0.51}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) layers, following potentiodynamic polarization measurements, are shown in Figure 5. The films exhibit no evidence of local delamination or microcrack formation, only some minor surface defects are observed. For comparison, crack formation was reported for 1.4-µm-thick sputter-deposited Ti/TiN multilayer coatings deposited by rf sputtering on aluminum substrates after 72 h of immersion in brine [66]. The films exhibit no evidence of local delamination or microcrack formation, only some minor surface defects, small pits of average diameter 0.4–1.4 µm, are observed.

![Plan-view SEM images of the surface morphology of 300-nm-thick Ti0.92Ta0.08N- and Ti0.41Al0.51Ta0.08N-coated 304 stainless-steel substrates acquired following 45 min of immersion in brine](https://example.com/figure5.png)

**Figure 5.** Plan-view SEM images of the surface morphology of 300-nm-thick (a) \( \text{Ti}_{0.92}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) and (b) \( \text{Ti}_{0.41}\text{Al}_{0.51}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \)-coated 304 stainless-steel substrates acquired following 45 min of immersion in brine and potentiodynamic measurements; typical minor surface defects are indicated by white circles/ellipses.

### 3.2.3. Impedance Measurements

The corrosion behavior of bare 304 stainless-steel substrates and substrates coated with 300-nm-thick \( \text{Ti}_{0.92}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) and \( \text{Ti}_{0.41}\text{Al}_{0.51}\text{Ta}_{0.08}\text{N} \) layers was also investigated using electrochemical impedance spectroscopy (EIS). This technique was employed to determine the long-term performance
of the coatings following immersion for 1, 24, 48, 72, and 168 h in 3.5% NaCl solution at room temperature. A small alternating-current signal, with minimal perturbation of the electrochemical system, was applied and the resulting current through the sample measured.

Figure 6 shows Bode plots for uncoated and Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N- and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N-coated 304 ss samples after 168 h of immersion in the electrolyte. The plots allow determination of the absolute system, was applied and the resulting current through the sample measured.

At high frequencies, the peak in $\Phi$ vs. $\omega$, Figure 6b, represents a strong capacitive response [55,56,67]. For bare 304 stainless-steel, the peak ($\Phi = 73.86^\circ$; $10^4$ to $10^6$ Hz) is due to the presence of a CrO$_x$ passive film which acts as a permeable protection barrier. The peaks for 304 ss coated with Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N ($\Phi = 71.80^\circ$; $10^2$ to $10^3$ Hz) and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N ($\Phi = 78.83; 10^3$ to $10^2$ Hz) layers correspond to the dielectric behavior of the coatings. After 168 h of immersion in saline solution,
the capacitance of the Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N film is higher than that of Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N. Over the frequency range from $10^{-1}$ to $10^{-2}$ Hz, the negative slope $\Phi$ vs. $\omega$ for the films indicates a change in the dielectric properties at the electrolyte/304-ss-substrate interface due to diffusion of the electrolyte through permeable coating defects including column boundaries.

To better understand the EIS results in Figure 6, the data are fit with an equivalent circuit (EC) model [55,68–70], which represents the transport of charge, with the equivalent amplitude and phase angle [54], during the electrochemical experiments. Values of the circuit components are a function of frequency $\omega$. The EC, based on the model proposed by Kending et al. [71], is shown in Figure 7 and describes the electrochemical processes developed in our samples.

R.E. in Figure 7 is the saturated calomel reference electrode; the 304 ss substrates coated with Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N are the working electrodes W.E. $R_{ct}$ represents the charge transfer and $CPE_{ct}$, in series with $R_{ct}$, accounts for charge transfer via advection to the film/substrate interface through defects. $R_{po}$ is the resistance, in series with $CPE_c$, to ion current through coating pores [56,71,72], and $CPE_c$ is the capacitance of the coating/electrolyte interface. The CPE impedance, $Z_{CPE} = Z_0(\omega)^{-m}$, varies with the power applied to the system via a power-law $m$, which is 0 for pure resistance and 1 for pure capacitance. If $m > 0.8$, CPE is considered capacitive [73].

Fits to EIS data were made with the Gamry Echem Analysis software (Version 5.30) [53] using the non-linear least squares method and the results are summarized in Table 2. For 304 stainless-steel, $R_{ct}$ and $R_{po}$ after 168 h of brine immersion are $1.1 \times 10^{-1}$ and $1.7 \times 10^{2}$ $\Omega$ cm$^{-2}$, which are approximately nine and two orders of magnitude, respectively, lower than corresponding values for Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N-coated samples, $R_{ct} = 1.0 \times 10^{10}$ and $R_{po} = 6.3 \times 10^{4}$ $\Omega$ cm$^{-2}$. For Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N-coated samples, $R_{ct} = 9.6 \times 10^{12}$ and $R_{po} = 2.8 \times 10^{4}$ $\Omega$ cm$^{-2}$. The much higher resistance values obtained for coated substrates indicates slow reaction velocities at coating/304-ss interfaces. The high values obtained for uncoated 304 ss are due to the formation of an unstable CrO$_x$ layer as discussed in 2.3.1, 3.2.1 and 3.2.2.

Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N- and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N-coated samples exhibit similar $R_{po}$ values that increase slightly with immersion time due to the partial blocking of permeable defects, such as column boundaries, with a thin oxide formed near the film surface [74]. However, the oxide layers do not completely protect the substrate from the electrolyte, as shown by the decrease in $R_{ct}$ after 48 h of immersion (Table 2). For both films, $CPE_c$ exhibits an $m_c$ index above 0.8, indicating capacitive behavior. For Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N-coated samples, $m_{dc}$ is approximately 0.5, representing a resistance, the Warburg impedance [54–56], to mass transfer.

Figure 8 shows experimental Bode impedance plots as a function of immersion time from 1 to 168 h for 304 ss substrates coated with 300-nm-thick Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers. We note that essentially identical results were obtained when we repeated the measurements on separate samples. The impedances for Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N, Figure 8a, and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N, Figure 8c, are both approximately $5 \times 10^6$ $\Omega$ cm$^{-2}$ at $10^{-2}$ Hz. The Bode plot of phase angle $\Phi$ vs. frequency for Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N-coated substrates, Figure 8b, exhibits a peak at $10^5$ Hz, with $\Phi = -69.5^\circ$, which decreases with immersion time during the first 24 h of testing due to electrolyte diffusion and the resulting formation of metal oxide layers blocking the defects. The increase in $\Phi$ with further immersion time indicates an increasingly capacitive response.

Table 2 shows that $R_{po}$ ranges from $3.9 \times 10^3$ at $t = 1$ h to $6.3 \times 10^3$ $\Omega$ cm$^{-2}$ at 168 h for Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N, and $2.0 \times 10^4$ to $2.8 \times 10^4$ $\Omega$ cm$^{-2}$ over the same time period for Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N. The equivalent results for bare 304 ss are $1.0 \times 10^2$ to $1.7 \times 10^5$ $\Omega$ cm$^{-2}$. Thus, the pore resistance of the films is more than two orders of magnitude higher than that of uncoated 304 ss. This is due to the greater capacitance of the films compared to the permeable CrO$_x$ passive layer formed on the uncoated 304 ss substrates, against electrolyte diffusion toward the coating/304-ss interface. The experimental measurement uncertainties in Table 2 are well within expected values based upon previous results for transition-metal-nitride/ss corrosion studies as shown in references [69,75]. Overall, the fits to the equivalent circuit are better than 95% in all cases.
Table 2. The results of fitting EIS data from Figure 8 with the equivalent-circuit model in Figure 7 for bare 304 stainless steel and 304-ss substrates coated with 300-nm-thick Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N thin films immersed in 3.5% brine solutions for 1, 24, 48, 72, and 168 h. $R_p$ is the polarization resistance, $R_a$ is the electrolyte (brine solution) resistance, $R_{dl}$ is the charge transfer, $CPE_{cd}$ is a constant-phase element representing the coating/304-ss-substrate interface, $R_{co}$ is the pore resistance of the coatings, $CPE_c$ is a constant phase element representing the coatings, and $m_c$ and $m_{dl}$ are the power-law values in the relationship $Z_{CPE} = Z_0 (j\omega)^{-m}$, for which $Z$ is the CPE impedance, $Z_0$ is the initial impedance, $\omega$ is the frequency, and $m$ is the power-law index.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time [h]</th>
<th>$R_p$ [Ω cm$^2$]</th>
<th>$R_a$ [Ω cm$^2$]</th>
<th>$R_{co}$ [Ω cm$^2$]</th>
<th>$CPE_c$ [S s$^{-m}$/cm$^2$]</th>
<th>$m_c$</th>
<th>$CPE_{dl}$ [S s$^{-m_{dl}}$/cm$^2$]</th>
<th>$m_{dl}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>61.73 ± 0.31 × 10$^{10}$</td>
<td>3.9 ± 0.8 × 10$^4$</td>
<td>6.6 ± 0.2 × 10$^{-6}$</td>
<td>8.7 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td>5.6 ± 0.2 × 10$^{-6}$</td>
<td>6.1 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>60.68 ± 0.80 × 10$^{10}$</td>
<td>1.9 ± 0.3 × 10$^4$</td>
<td>1.3 ± 0.05 × 10$^{-5}$</td>
<td>8.2 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td>5.2 ± 0.6 × 10$^{-6}$</td>
<td>8.8 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>62.93 ± 0.0002 × 10$^{11}$</td>
<td>1.1 ± 0.1 × 10$^5$</td>
<td>9.8 ± 0.2 × 10$^{-6}$</td>
<td>8.3 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td>7.4 ± 0.4 × 10$^{-6}$</td>
<td>7.7 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>60.41 ± 2.70 × 10$^{10}$</td>
<td>5.8 ± 1.0 × 10$^4$</td>
<td>7.6 ± 0.2 × 10$^{-6}$</td>
<td>8.5 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td>5.4 ± 0.2 × 10$^{-6}$</td>
<td>6.9 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>168</td>
<td>58.43 ± 1.0 × 10$^{10}$</td>
<td>6.3 ± 1.2 × 10$^4$</td>
<td>9.5 ± 0.3 × 10$^{-6}$</td>
<td>8.4 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td>4.7 ± 0.3 × 10$^{-6}$</td>
<td>7.3 × 10$^{-1}$</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ti$<em>{0.41}$Al$</em>{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N/304 ss</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Time [h]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>168</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 304 ss |
|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|--------|-----------------|--------|
| Time [h] | $R_p$ [Ω cm$^2$] | $R_a$ [Ω cm$^2$] | $R_{co}$ [Ω cm$^2$] | $CPE_c$ [S s$^{-m}$/cm$^2$] | $m_c$ | $CPE_{dl}$ [S s$^{-m_{dl}}$/cm$^2$] | $m_{dl}$ |
| 1        | 75.00 ± 2.6 ± 0.01 × 10$^{-1}$ | 1.0 ± 0.4 × 10$^2$ | 8.3 ± 1.3 × 10$^{-5}$ | 9.3 × 10$^{-1}$ | 2.8 ± 1.2 × 10$^{-5}$ | 5.1 × 10$^{-1}$ |
| 24       | 68.00 ± 4.6 ± 0.3 × 10$^{-1}$ | 2.2 ± 0.3 × 10$^2$ | 1.7 ± 0.3 × 10$^{-4}$ | 5.1 × 10$^{-1}$ | 1.7 ± 0.8 × 10$^{-4}$ | 8.6 × 10$^{-1}$ |
| 48       | 73.00 ± 3.6 ± 0.02 × 10$^{-1}$ | 1.7 ± 0.5 × 10$^2$ | 1.8 ± 0.4 × 10$^{-4}$ | 5.1 × 10$^{-1}$ | 1.8 ± 0.7 × 10$^{-4}$ | 8.9 × 10$^{-1}$ |
| 72       | 65.00 ± 1.6 ± 1.1 × 10$^{-1}$ | 3.7 ± 0.2 × 10$^2$ | 1.6 ± 0.2 × 10$^{-4}$ | 8.1 × 10$^{-1}$ | 1.3 ± 0.7 × 10$^{-4}$ | 5.2 × 10$^{-1}$ |
| 168      | 73.00 ± 1.1 ± 9.2 × 10$^{-1}$ | 1.7 ± 0.2 × 10$^2$ | 1.4 ± 0.4 × 10$^{-4}$ | 7.0 × 10$^{-1}$ | 9.0 ± 6.1 × 10$^{-5}$ | 9.2 × 10$^{-1}$ |

Figure 8. Experimental Bode impedance plots as a function of brine immersion time from 1 to 168 h for 304 ss substrates coated with 300-nm thick (a), (b) Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers and (c), (d) Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers. (a) and (c) are plots of impedance $|Z|$ vs. frequency $\omega$, while (b) and (d) show the phase angle $\Phi$ vs. $\omega$. The curves are fit using the equivalent-circuit model in Figure 7, with parametric values listed in Table 2.
For Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N, Figure 8d, the capacitance near 10$^3$ Hz decreases (Φ decreases from 78.4 to 74.1°) between 1 and 168 h of immersion, indicating some electrolyte diffusion through small pores in the coating. Over the frequency range 10$^0$ to 10$^{-2}$ Hz, Φ is approximately 50° after 1 h of immersion suggesting a relatively low capacitance due to electrolyte diffusion through permeable defects such as column boundaries. Figure 9 shows plane-view SEM images of Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N films after 168 h of immersion in brine and EIS measurements, only a few surface defects are visible; there is no indication of cracks or delamination. In addition, as shown below, XPS depth profiles revealed no interdiffusion of Fe, Cr, or Ni from the substrates into the coatings.

Figure 9. Plan-view SEM images, acquired after EIS measurements following 168 h of immersion in 3.5% NaCl electrolyte at room temperature, of 300-nm-thick (a) Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N-and (b) Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N-coated 304 stainless-steel substrates. Typical surface defects are marked with white arrows. There is no indication of film cracking or delamination.

3.3. XPS Depth Profiles

XPS depth profiles of Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers before and after 168 h of immersion in saline solution reveal that film compositions, including the oxygen concentration (≤0.4 at % as noted in Section 2.2.1) after removing the air-exposed surface contamination, remain constant throughout their entire depth. In addition, no signal due to Na or Cl from the saline solution, or due to Fe, Cr or Ni from the substrates is detected.

4. Conclusions

Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N thin films, 300-nm-thick, are deposited with no substrate heating on 304 stainless-steel substrates using reactive hybrid HiPIMS/DCMS co-sputtering with metal-ion-synchronized substrate bias to provide densification via heavy Ta-ion bombardment of the growing film. Film-growth temperatures due to plasma heating are <120 °C (Ts/Tm < 0.12). The films exhibit excellent corrosion resistance, in protecting stainless-steel substrates, during potentiodynamic, and electrochemical impedance measurements carried out in 3.5% saline solutions for periods up to 168 h. For comparison, the reference TiN layers grown by conventional DCMS in the same sputtering system and under the same conditions of temperature and pressure (see Ref. [40]) showed practically no corrosion protection.

XPS depth profiles of Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N layers recorded after 168 h of immersion in saline solution during electrochemical measurements show uniform layer compositions throughout entire film thickness. In addition, no signal due to Na or Cl from the saline solution, or due to Fe, Cr or Ni from the substrates is detected. This confirms that the films are fully dense. Corrosion protective efficiencies were above 99.8% for both Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N and Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N, and pore resistance was apparently four orders of magnitude higher than for bare 304 stainless-steel substrates. We attribute the fact that the EIS corrosion resistance of Ti$_{0.41}$Al$_{0.51}$Ta$_{0.08}$N films is slightly better than
that of Ti$_{0.92}$Ta$_{0.08}$N to the formation of an aluminum-oxide passivation layer, which is important for enhancing corrosion protection.


**Funding:** This work was in part financed by CONACyT-Mexico through Grants CB-2012-01 179304, INFR-2011-01 163219, CB-2007-01 80285 and Fronteras 2015-02-809. Financial support from the Swedish Research Council VR Grants 2014-5790 and 2018-03957, an Åforsk foundation grant #16-359, the Swedish Government Strategic Coatings 2019 12. Gall, D.; Petrov, I.; Greene, J.E. Epitaxial Sc...
28. Hakansson, G.; Sundgren, J.-E.; McIntyre, D.; Greene, J.E.; Munz, W.-D. Microstructure and physical properties of polycrystalline metastable Ti0.5Al0.5N alloys grown by magnetron sputter deposition. Thin Solid Films 1997, 153, 55–65. [CrossRef]


41. Grezynski, G.; Lu, J.; Johansson, M.P.; Jensen, J.; Petrov, I.; Greene, J.E.; Hultman, L. Role of Ti\textsuperscript{n+} and Al\textsuperscript{n+} ion irradiation (n = 1, 2) during Ti\textsubscript{1-x}Al\textsubscript{x}N alloy film growth in a hybrid HIPIMS/magnetron mode. Surf. Coat. Technol. 2012, 206, 4202–4211. [CrossRef]

42. Grezynski, G.; Petrov, I.; Greene, J.E.; Hultman, L. A paradigm shift in thin-film growth by magnetron sputtering: from gas-ion to metal-ion irradiation of the growing film. J. Vac. Sci. Technol. A 2019, 37, 060801. [CrossRef]

43. Grezynski, G.; Lu, J.; Petrov, I.; Greene, J.E.; Bolz, S.; Kölker, W.; Schiffer, C.; Lemmer, O.; Hultman, L. Metal versus rare-gas ion irradiation during Ti\textsubscript{1-x}Al\textsubscript{x}N film growth by hybrid high power pulsed magnetron/dc magnetron co-sputtering using synchronized pulsed substrate bias. J. Vac. Sci. Technol. A 2012, 30, 061504. [CrossRef]

44. Fager, H.; Tengstrand, O.; Lu, J.; Bolz, S.; Mesic, B.; Kölker, W.; Schiffer, C.; Lemmer, O.; Greene, J.E.; Hultman, L.; et al. Low-temperature growth of dense and hard Ti\textsubscript{0.41}Al\textsubscript{0.51}Ta\textsubscript{0.08}N films via hybrid HIPIMS/DC magnetron co-sputtering with synchronized metal-ion irradiation. J. Appl. Phys. 2017, 121, 171902. [CrossRef]


56. Liu, C.; Bi, Q.; Leyland, A.; Matthews, A. An electrochemical impedance spectroscopy study of the corrosion behaviour of PVD coated steels in 0.5 N NaCl aqueous solution: Part II: EIS interpretation of corrosion behavior. Corros. Sci. 2003, 45, 1257–1273. [CrossRef]


73. Liu, C.; Bi, Q.; Matthews, A. EIS comparison on corrosion performance of PVD TiN and CrN coated mild steel in 0.5 N NaCl aqueous solution. Corros. Sci. 2001, 43, 1953–1961. [CrossRef]


75. Liu, C.; Bi, Q.; Leyland, A.; Matthews, A. An electrochemical impedance spectroscopy study of the corrosion behaviour of PVD coated steels in 0.5 N NaCl aqueous solution: Part, I: EIS interpretation of corrosion behavior. Corros. Sci. 2003, 45, 1243–1256. [CrossRef]